

Indigenous Ethics in Tourism Education: Bali as a Case

by Ida Bagus Putu Suamba

Submission date: 30-Apr-2022 12:20AM (UTC+0700)

Submission ID: 1824015373

File name: AEJ-GCTALE-Volume-4.pdf (1.09M)

Word count: 8805

Character count: 47470

Indigenous Ethics in Tourism Education: Bali as a Case

28

Ida Bagus Putu Suamba

Department of Business Administration, Politeknik Negeri Bali, Badung, Bali, Indonesia

Email: bagusputusuamba@pnb.ac.id

Abstract. This study attempts to formulate basic principles of Balinese indigenous ethics that can be taught in education of Bali tourism; they are rooted in its tradition. These ethical values may be utilized in the tourism establishment and practices. This is a qualitative study, the data is taken through interviews to some researchers in tourism, government officers, stake holders, business persons concern, and library research. Amidst of influences of western style of tourism, it is found that there are some principles of indigenous ethics, viz. divinity, *tri-hita-karana*, *tri-kala*, purity vs. impurity, parallelism of two different poles of reality, *tri mandala/tri-angga*, balancing, *atithi deva bhava*, and speak nice words to other that may be used along with the Western ones. They can be grouped into three domains, viz. ethics for handling nature, human, and products or services including entertainment in tourism. These ethical values comprise of Balinese hospitality in tourism; and these things are taken carefully as to make sure the guest is satisfied and happy. It puts emphasis on the means rather of the end in line with the philosophy of work of Balinese. In tourism education, there are at least there are five connected parties, namely (1) government, (2) educational institution, (3) industries, (4) traditional local village (*desa pakraman*), and (5) mass media channels to educate people ethical values and wisdom. In practice they are basically connected in a system of education. Irrespective various channels may be utilized, either formal or non-formal or informal, or mix of them, the matter of ways to spread profiting modern means is worth to think for successful ethical education in tourism. The novelty of this research is an attempt to formulate principles of indigenous Balinese ethics that can be included in the tourism education.

Keywords: Indigenous, Ethics, Bali Tourism, Education

1 INTRODUCTION

Tourism is sometimes only viewed as a business activity, meanwhile classical issues like virtues and vice, good and bad, or right and wrong seem to be marginalized if not neglected from practices; too much focuses have been given on capital earnings overshadowing ethical dimensions of its sustainability. It does not mean that the present tourism is absent from such remarks which call for more ethical or responsible tourism. Ethical issues have increased in tourism, and consequently there has resulted efforts to maximizing its potentials and minimizing its negative impacts. Unfortunately, only small number of people are really aware of this issue not yet meaningful effort that have been attempted; and really speaking it is not yet a global comprehensive

action. ⁴ The Global Code of Ethics for Tourism (1999) is a bold response to such worries as tourism has grown rapidly in the world leaving many drawbacks both on nature and culture. Nonetheless its successfulness much depends on those stake holders, industries, tourism players, related organizations, visitors, and educational institutions to boost the principles of ethics in practices.

It is true that tourism has become ¹⁵ one of the most remarkable economic and social phenomena of the past century and still continues at present. The number of international arrivals shows an evolution from a mere 25 million international arrivals in 1950 to over 700 million in 2002, corresponding to an average annual growth rate of 6.6% (World Tourism Organization, 2005). In addition to the numerical growth of tourism, there has been an increasing geographic spread of tourism to encompass almost all the reaches of the globe (Enea, 2007); and Bali is not an exception in this regards if we look at the early period of its inception when foreign travellers had arrived in this land in the early 1920's. From it onwards seemingly increasing number of visitors had come to enjoy its beauty. The numbers of students joining tourism related course or pursuing tourism degree have been increasing significantly in last 40 years ¹⁵ not yet counting them opting courses in vocational studies in tourism industries. Enea as cited in Fleckenstein and Huebsch (1999); Hudson and Miller (2005) stated that tourism organizations are beginning to realize that promoting their ethical stance can be good business as it potentially enhances a company's profits, management effectiveness, public image, and employee relations. ¹⁴ Yet, although more attention is now being paid to ethics in tourism and as cited in Holden (2003), Kalisch (2002) there is a very weak foundation of research into tourism ethics studies to date. It is shown in curricular activities.

The case will become interesting as well as challenging when indigenous ethical values or principles are taken into consideration when designing tourism establishment. ⁸ The ethical foundation of which should be initiated from education at schools or universities. The Global Code of Ethics for Tourism (article 2) also mentions that the introduction into curricula of education about the value of tourist exchanges, their economic, ¹⁹ social and cultural benefits, and also their risks, should be encouraged; As Fennel (2009) said that ethical theory, therefore, provides the most appropriate means by which to build a platform for expressing a shared responsibility in tourism as cited in Tribe (ed.) (2009, p. 211). Due to weaknesses in ethical base, for a long run, as too much stress given on business aspect rather than on ethical values, many problems arose that tourism should ideally not kill tourism itself rather it should bring and promote prosperity for all; both should go hand by hand profiting ethical principles in both management and quality control. When the problems of ethics in tourism have been identified and/or formulated, the question of ethical values professed by society becomes obvious needs not only to be addressed but practiced for which ethical theories can strengthen the practice of tourism. ²⁶ As Harrison (2017) mentioned that "right kind of tourism" is for "right kind of tourist" that the role of ethics is acknowledged in the practice of tourism based on righteousness not only in designing or planning but also implementation.

The fact that development of tourism as a business has been greatly influenced by globalism including ethical values or principles which are commonly originated from Western tradition enhanced by the massive spread of technologies. They are carried out by visitors or have been

introduced to indigenous people through modern channels of communication or system of education. Some basic conceptions of ethics originated like whether ethical values/principles are absolute or relative from Ancient Greek to modern European philosophers like the conception of deontology, virtue-based, categorical imperatives, etc. have coloured the practices of business including tourism. However, when global code of ethics for responsible tourism is adopted which materialized in UNWTO formulation (2001), indigenous ethical values become marginalized if not faded away from tourism practices despite the fact that local tourism or culture is respected in the due course for benefit of local people, culture, and environment; neither serious attention paid on it, nor implementation of education aspects. Due to this fact, there has been an increasing awareness on the importance of indigenous knowledge in which ethical values are integral part of them to be utilized in tourism. Being indigenous, it has sometimes inferior connotation, marginalized, or not systematic, which is certainly not always true, which is doubted to be able equally exists in tourism. Increasing worries come up that imbalance of nature can create serious social, cultural health problem for them. In other words, threat towards the sustainability of nature should become primary concern of tourism amid of economic benefits that have been given by tourism. Needless to state that nature and the flourish of a culture in which language acts as the vehicle, there is an unavoidable relationship. In this regards, Mungra quoted Kramsch (1998) that she delineates the term culture and explores the relationship between language and culture. She further sustains her argument by drawing reference to one poem by Emily Dickinson, which she considered a metaphorical stylised reference to the relationship between language, nature, and culture: underlying a socialisation/acculturation role of language by its community of practioners (cop). She further draws the reader's attention to the fact that the standards and norms of this cop help created its "culture" both in the perception and in the reception of language, used in context (p.102).

When ethical values or principles have been formulated, the question of how to spread or teach students, people, stake holders, business person, and tourists becomes essential and has a strategic position in the continuation of tourism. The significance of ethics may be acknowledged by all especially as applied science of values but to act accordingly requires commitment and real action. This is a big task to be undertaken if one is keen on the tourism sustainable or tourism should generate wellness for all. Our system of education emphasises more on competencies or skills rather than attitude how to live together in respect to nature. Emotional relation of teacher-students is getting loose as more technologies involve in teaching and learning. High competitiveness in industries causes the system seems to have low interest in ethical values. Therefore, authority in this regards should be present to save tourism from uncontrolled or unethical practices of business. In so far, teaching ethical values is much emphasized on behaving between human and human not on human to nature making ethics become anthropocentric, moreover the ethical principles believed has its source in a particular religion. Just recently as the consequence of increasing damage of nature, a call for restoring conserving environment has been issued for the concerned to think of. Hultsman (1995) stated that a tourism services ethic can be viewed as a foundational and articulated notion of what tourism professionals collectively accept and

tacitly understand as being principled behavior (pp. 553-567). Business-oriented activity should not overshadow ethical dimensions of tourism.

2 METHOD

This paper attempts to formulate indigenous ethics of tourism which may be contributed amidst massive influence of globalism in tourism education of Bali. It is a qualitative study, the data are taken from interviews of twenty informants consists of stake holders, hotel/restaurant managers, tour guides, academicians, researchers in tourism, and library study using purposive sampling technique.

3 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 *Tourism, nature, and ethics*

Having remarkable growth in the last fifty years, tourism has become not only a leisure and an industry but a social force to change people's mind and life style. Increasing number of people especially in developing countries have adopted tourist life style as their income increased due to tourism. There are a number of defining characteristics of tourism as a social and physical phenomenon that require us to consider alternative approaches to 'the tourism question': Tourism involves (often complex) social, cultural, economic, and ecological interactions. These interactions take place *en route* to and in a 'destination' which is also someone's 'place' (house, village, town, city, nation, mountain, jungle, beach, backyard). The visitor (and industry providers) may value this 'place' and their 'host' less than they do their own place and community. These interactions often involve power differentials – often with the visitor and tourism industry expressing power in a number of ways over the host. These interactions may result in harms or benefits – to host (and possibly the visitor too), to their communities, their economies and their ecologies. Tourists (and other stakeholders in the tourism 'exchange') are inherently selfish – each seeking to maximize their personal (or group or corporate) value, and sceptical to moral issues as a logical consequence of tourism. As Suamba (2019) mentions that there happened a growing awareness all over the world that the natural world has limits that our current assumptions and activities are quickly exceeding it. Greed-based business wants to take more from nature without giving anything to it (pp. 52-53). Maximizing nature potentials is not followed by maximizing effort to conserve it. As remarked by Kilipiris and Zardava (2012) that "in real practice, green tourism is used sometimes by the tourism industry as a label, providing information to the tourist such as how to conserve energy, avoid littering in the beach etc., and not actually touching the major impacts of tourism. While strong competition exists between tourist enterprises it seems logical their unwillingness to implement green strategies. There are for instance cases where the economic benefits of tourism very little remain locally and are repatriated to foreign countries (pp. 44-52)". When damage of nature happened due to tourism, local people suffers more from its negative impacts of it rather than investor. Owing this fact, whatever tourism may be developed in a particular area or region, tourism and nature are inseparable units for which those question considerations can behave as the frame work to think, design, and establish sustainable tourism.

For 'right tourism' that we wish to have it should be based on metaphysical consideration, and it should consider ethical values especially of the local people to be included in the establishment. "Right tourism" is for happiness in the right sense of the term.

It is interesting to think that tourism is often selfish for which human likes to take more from nature without appropriate return to it. This goes back to philosophy of life professed in which material wealth become the main target keeping blind with ethical and social dimensions. What is obvious that tourism stimulates hedonism life style seeking for highest happiness of bodily enjoyment for which nature becomes the object of enjoyment. With reference to eco-tourism, Wright (1993) formulates eight key fundamental principles for sustainable industry and tourism since they are connected. (1) It should not degrade the resource and should be developed in an environmentally sound manner; (2) it should provide first-hand, participatory, and enlightening experiences; (3) it should involve education among all parties - local communities, government, non-governmental organizations, industry, and tourists (before, during, and after the trip); (4) it should encourage all-party recognition of the intrinsic values of the resource; (5) it should involve acceptance of the resource on its own terms, and in recognition of its limits, which involves supply-oriented management; (6) it should promote understanding and involve partnerships between many players, which could include government, non-government organizations, industry, scientists, and locals (both before and during operations); (7) it should promote moral and ethical responsibilities and behaviours towards the natural and cultural environment, by all players; and (8) it should provide long-term benefits - to the resource, to the local community, and to industry (benefits may be conservation, scientific, social, cultural, or economic¹². In addition to education, moral and ethical responsibilities underlining behaviour becomes a serious concern as imbalance of nature is getting worse. When the issue of ethical tourism has come up, it can be understood that what have been practiced in business does not seriously implement ethical principles despite the fact Global Code of Ethics for Tourism (2001) was formulated; its implementation in the field is still weak because it is only based on awareness on the importance of ethical values. Suamba and Utama (2017) observed that there has not ever been critical consideration undertaken on the basis of ethics; rather most concerns or efforts have been given on cultural, ecological, and economic fields blended with political interests (p. 83). Owing to this fact a call for global ethical awareness and implementation is not only important but an urgent action that should be done.

This is worth to consider ethically since nature has limited capacity, whereas human desires are unlimited. A short-term objective for financial profit is fine but it can be harmful for nature when ethical tourism has just been a ploy of business. Ethical tourism, responsible tourism, eco-tourism, or any other terms used, must not be a discourse in academic meeting only; it should be put into practice; and the role of authority is pivotal. This awareness has been started especially in the Western world when quality of environment had decreased due to excessive use of environment or green revolution, a tourism practice without careful design on its sustainability. Further observation shows that preserving nature basically keeping the business running well since well-preserved nature is the underlying foundation for any business created. Any business requires

place for activities. This matter has become a spirit of the Global Code of Ethics for Tourism, especially article 3 states that tourism, a factor of sustainable development. Nature tourism and ecotourism are recognized as being particularly conducive to enriching and enhancing the standing of tourism, provided they respect the natural heritage and local populations and are in keeping with the carrying capacity of the sites. All forms of tourism development that are conducive to saving rare and precious resources, in particular water and energy. Tourism infrastructure should be designed and tourism activities programmed in such a way as to protect the natural heritage composed of ecosystems and biodiversity and to preserve endangered species of wildlife. This awareness should be always echoed in every moment since sometimes people are blind to see promising benefits earned only from tourism and fail to see the continuation of it with respect to nature and culture. This state of affairs if not addressed in a comprehensive way by all parties involved under the leadership of the authority, it can create serious environmental problem especially in developing countries. Global warming will go faster devastating the world despite the fact awareness even action to cope with the matter has been done.

Tourism can yield a serious ethical problem with reference to the relationships of man to man and man to nature (which is a part of *tri-hita-karana*), conception of ethics in Balinese tradition; not yet counting rules and regulations issued by authority. Imbalance with them causes disharmony, and it becomes roots of problems. This is basically the view originated from metaphysical conception of being and becoming to look at the emerging issues. Bad design of mass tourism which is adopted by many countries in the world is suspected that it can harm nature, culture, and finally creatures and human beings. Proof has testified that excessive used of nature seems to be uncontrolled due to uncontrolled desire to get capital back, whereas law enforcement is still weak mostly in developing countries. When mass tourism is developed expecting huge number of visitors to come, it requires more lands/spaces for infrastructures, more buildings are built, more water required, more powers, and more wastes especially uncycled stuffs carried by it. Land conversion in Bali has been increasing per years in the last five years from 2013 to 2017 average 550-hectares land per year or it is about 0.4 percent from the whole. In 2017 happened significance increase reaching 900 hectares of land or about 1.13 percent from the whole of 78.626 hectares. The land was mostly converted into road, housing, hotels, shops, and restaurants (*Times Bali*, 2018) due to massive development of tourism. The conversation happens in Denpasar, Badung, Gianyar, and Tabanan regencies of South Bali. The decline of *subak* (traditional irrigation system) areas due to land conversation is unstoppable; and this become negative factor that can ruin the sustainability of Bali tourism. Unfortunately, there is not yet a comprehensive policy to the preservation of *subak* despite the fact *subak* system of irrigation like the one in Jati Luwih of Tabanan regency has been recognised by UNESCO in 2012 as a human heritage that should be preserved.

Almost none has studied number of rubbish, wastes, and faeces of tourism not yet counting unseen bad things produced by visitors coming and enjoying their times in Bali despite of the recycling process might have happened involve modern technology. In addition to investment of big capital, massive move of tourists usually followed by increasing number of workers along with

its social problems involved in it. The idea of green farm cannot be reached since water supply is split for tourism facilities. Increasing number of farm land is getting difficult to get water from the water reservoirs due to utilizing for tourism facilities. Notwithstanding, the development of tourism does not always earn positive results; it is a sensitive business which is often effected by so many factors, like natural calamities, health, and security. Unfortunately impacts of careless or irresponsible practice of tourism are not thoroughly dealt rather attempt may be done just like a marketing ploy. As Suamba and Utama (2017) remarked that most people think economic growth contributes significantly rather the basis of moral or ethics on which development should be carried out. The importance of ethics was overshadowed by the interest in economic benefits as that is used as indicator for achieving progress. Accelerating economic benefits by making use ecological aspects seem to be too much if not destroying ecological balance; not yet counting how massive effect the global warming of the globe has been giving to us. In short, ethical reflection is required to shape Bali tourism going on in right direction without threatening Balinese life, nature, and culture (p.84). Right tourism has its base on right action, one amongst of *tri-kaya* (three actions) believed by Balinese since only good action (*subha karma*) can guide human being to reach happiness.

3.2 Some principles of indigenous Balinese ethics

As globalism have been spreading almost to all corners of the world, indigenous knowledge especially in Africa, Asia, and Latin America is in a threat of extinction as less or no more local people pay interest and preserve it. They like to use and follow already established system of knowledge, which commonly comes from the Western world. As Fennel (2009) remarked that it is indeed surprising that the willingness of researchers to explore ethics in tourism has been marginal, especially given that tourism, by its nature, emphasizes the value of one over the value of others. This axiom is supported by the fact that tourism creates innumerable negative costs (impacts) that stem from the pursuit of primarily hedonistic ends (as cited in Fennel, 2008; see also Przeclawski, 1996) rather than spiritually peace mind. He further mentions that value has been defined by Hodgkinson (1983, p. 36) as 'a concept of the desirable with a motivating force'. This definition implies the following: (1) A value is an abstraction (i.e. a concept). It is imposed by humans on something that may have no inherent value (e.g. diamonds); (2) A value is something that is socially acceptable (i.e. desirable) as opposed to individually desired. For example, sadism may be desired by some but not desirable by most; (3) A value pushes us into action (i.e. motivating force). Another way to see this is that our behaviour is a manifestation of what we value (2009, p. 214). A person cannot be separated from the values one believes. Nonetheless the significance of indigenous value is acknowledged as goodness and wisdom subtly prevalent in it despite the fact people are not care of it. Attempts and energies should be dedicated to establish a new system of knowledge originated from indigenous culture; whereas the ready established one offers so many chances and benefits which attract people to study.

With reference to culture developments since past times, rather than adopting, some countries try hard to accommodate foreign culture with a careful absorption into its local culture. Rather than

adopting, adaptation is more challenging provided creativity and attitude of respecting goodness available wherever its origin is, the result of which come out a compromised culture, a new fresh expression of culture. For the latter, Bali is a good example that since its past times it had accomplished a cultural dialog with external values in which it accepts the best from foreign cultures and integrated into its own system. Despite of many foreign cultures had arrived and accommodated in this land, it is still its Bali-ness is prevalent in all aspects of culture, and ultimately it grows and develops in a distinctive way. Similarly, its ethical values had received influences from foreign cultures and accommodated with its own in a harmonious manner. Interestingly, its sources not only derived from oral tradition as encapsulated in folklore but also its textual tradition of various genres, especially from *sasana/niti* literature. With reference to preservation of nature and sustainable tourism, Suamba (2018) in his study has yielded some basic ethical principles explored from Balinese tradition: (1) Divinity. By nature, each and every creature is divine; none entity in this world remains in isolation rather each of them is divinely connected in some ways with the other. Due to impurity attached the self, we are ignorant of our real self and have a wrong perception on a particular object. Owing to this fact, no exclusiveness is developed rather than inclusiveness to all; (2) *tri-hita-karana*, three kinds of relationship, viz. man to man, man to nature, and man to God, which promotes harmonious relationship with external agencies or objects both of human and non-human. Relation is possible only after they have the same nature whose core is in divinity, and by relation human being understands his position, status, and role in preserving nature; (3) The concept of time (*kala*) which is divided into three elements (*tri-kala*), viz. past, present, and future is important concept especially in positioning oneself in frame of time in designing sustainable tourism; and when future time is considered tourism established should sustain not only for tourism itself but also for nature; and (4) Purity and impurity are considered in advance prior to establishment of any business effort or in the post of any activity which is considered triggering impurity (*mala*). Since impurity (*mala*) has negative force spiritually, any design or establishment of tourism facilities should avoid such things. Mudana, *et. al.* (2018) mention that the need for the application of political ethics, economic (business) ethics, environmental ethics, and cultural ethics, in this increasingly democratic and global-digital lifetime demands not only civil and political rights but also other rights such as economic rights, environmental rights, and cultural rights. So far it is only known human rights (*hak azasi manusia*) when in fact not only humans who have rights but also the environment or the other more especially in Bali with the principle of *tri-hita-karana*. In addition to these principles, some important values in relation to external world are (5) the parallelisms of two different realities, like microcosm and macrocosm, (6) *tri-mandala/tri-anga*, three divisions of an area/region. The traditional village or housing complex, etc. are designed based on the division of three areas (*mandala*), like those of human bodies consisting of three parts, viz. head, body, and legs, or main area (*uttama mandala*), middle area (*madhya mandala*), and the outer part region (*kanista mandala*); and (7) balancing between two different poles of powers of *sakala-niskala*, macro-microcosm, materiality-spirituality, etc. They are binaries which always come together to perform a particular purpose. None can escape from the reach of these two opposing powers or realities.

⁹ Hospitality refers to the relationship between a guest and a host, wherein the host receives the guest with goodwill, including the reception and entertainment of guests, visitors, or strangers. Louis, chevalier de Jaucourt describes hospitality in the *Encyclopédie* as the virtue of a great soul that cares for the whole universe through the ties of humanity (“Hospitality” in *Wikipedia*). The relationship is covered by set of ethical principles. With reference to dealing with visitors, there are some ethical values for human-to-human relationship originated from Balinese tradition. The values can also be used in business context. These values are supposed to be the spirit of Balinese hospitality incorporating Western ones. Amongst the values which can be introduced are: (1) *athiti deva bhavo* (respecting guest like god). Balinese by nature respect guest irrespective of ethnicity, religion, caste, creeds, linguistic, and cultural background, who visits him; and tries the best for him/her. This is perhaps influence received from Indian tradition since there is a cultural tight since ancient times. From this stems the Indian practice of graciousness towards guests at home and in all social situations. The *Tirukkural*, an ancient Indian work on ethics and morality, explains the ethics of hospitality through its verses 81 through 90, dedicating a separate chapter on it (chapter 9). (“Hospitality” in *Wikipedia*). Owing to that reason, one should show good looking, nice and warm hospitality so that the guest feels free and happy. Guest is treated like family so he/she feels free to act. In the context of tourism, this principle is implemented in some villages in Bali like in Ubud, Kuta, Sanur, etc. in which Balinese family accepts limited guest to stay in his/her house. The guest stays with the host and learns Balinese life and culture. The ideas of tourism village (*desa wisata*) is in compatible with treating guest like family. This practice is based on the principles of divinity, as explained previously, which exists in every creature, so by nature essentially we are the same; and (2) Speak sweet words and avoid anger, rudeness, unfriendly manner when accepting or speaking others. This point is a manifestation of truthful in speaking, a part of *Tri-kaya-parisudha* (the perfect actions), viz. right thought, right speech and right action, as a very important virtue is Balinese ethics.

Ethical values are much required in Bali tourism as tourism will mean nothing for Bali unless it follows ethical principles rooted in indigenous culture. These ethical values can be grouped into three domains, viz. ethics for handling nature, human, and products or services including entertainment in tourism, manifestations of the concept of *tri-hita-karana*. A short-term objective in earning benefit is fine but considering the whole Bali as a pure place for all ages is much important (Suamba, 2018) for which the confluence of culture, nature, human being, technology, and modern life style should be wisely managed for the betterment of life. Those ethical principles along other foreign virtues are supposed to bring Bali tourism to run in the right tract minimizing problems of ethics like solid waste, condition of employment, non-specific discrimination, race, employee theft, sex discrimination, false advertising, sexual harassment, vendors’ honesty, sanitation violation, AIDS discrimination, etc. To reach such state the role of education is pivotal point to be considered in designing Bali tourism.

3.3 Education

For right tourism which ends in well beings of Balinese, system of education having local

dimensions is necessarily required. As mentioned by Hulstman (1995) that a brief review of extant literature on the subject suggests five general categories of literature that deal with ethical issues in tourism, viz. (1) issues related to ecological impacts, (2) marketing, (3) sustainable development, (4) humanistic and social concerns, and (5) education. Since tourism educational materials do not appear to deal adequately with ethical issues endeavour to infusing issue of ethics into tourism education (pp. 553-567).

It is a chance to deal it with more comprehensive approaches that school curricula as a means to imbue the ethical values through teaching and learning process. The issue is rather in domain of policy maker in the education than the real action in the field. There should be awareness and political will of the authority to address the issue that right tourism should be directed by sets of ethical values principles originated from its environment without being exclusive. He further mentions that while there have been some limited empirical attempts to investigate professionalism and ethicality among tourism service providers and students (cited in Freedman and Bartholomew, 1990; Sheldon, 1989), the primary aspect of this facet of tourism and ethics that emerged from the literature focused on the extent to which ethics are imparted to students in professional curriculum. That case will be more appealing when the policy implemented in related vocational schools in tourism industry. This fact is difficult to materialize in schools which are not connected with tourism. As Hegarty (1990) noted, while there is a strong ethical dimension underlying much of what the tourism industry has to offer (e. g. guest satisfaction, public responsibility), the idea of ethics in tourism - given its connections to business - seems contradictory. Hegarty (1995) did, however, argue that ethics should be included in professional curricula.... In general, there is no consensus on the extent to which ethics are effectively combined with practical education in tourism curricula, although citations that dealt with the topic were all in agreement that such efforts are an important and necessary component of tourism and hospitality education (pp. 553-567). Needless to say that whatever education may be pursued in tourism, providing life skills preparing students for future life is untenable to dismiss. In this regards, Stewart quoted Stone, Duffy, Pinckney, and Templeton-Bradley (2017) point out that critical-thinking skills, higher-order thinking, and collaboration are a must for learners who wish to succeed in the tourism/hospitality industry in the future since they will have to deal with significant global challenges (e.g. climate change, peak oil, and terrorism) (p. 80). Opportunities for this kind of skills development have traditionally been the purview of universities. This seems to provide justification the argument that universities have a significant role to play in helping learners who wish to work in the tourism/hospitality industry to develop the kinds of skills mentioned above (p. 196). Since in this field of work involves company or people coming from different countries and cultural background, IT skills are required if not it is a must skill that should be mastered.

The contradiction seems to be the fact that each has its own goal with reference its nature: business is a profit-oriented activity, whereas ethics deals with the highest good no matter an action has a business side or not.

The importance of ethical values in tourism is acknowledged as mentioned by the Global Code

of Ethics for Tourism (2001) in its article ⁸ 2 that the introduction into curricula of education about the value of tourist exchanges, their economic, social and cultural benefits, and also their risks, should be encouraged; now it comes its education dimension; how these ethical values should be communicated to the concerned people or party; and how to educate peoples amidst massive development of tourism both in national and local regions. It is understood as knowledge of ethical theories to be aware of and the competence one performs in the field to demonstrate ethical values. This is not so simple since there is not yet such systematic way to deal with the case rather informal or non-formal channels may be more effective supported by social media. School curriculum is already in burden with various subjects in each level focusing more on cognitive domain of knowledge rather than imbibing ethical or aesthetical value to develop students full-developed personality. With reference to Bali, there is no course of Balinese indigenous ethics included in school/university curricula, rather the values are implicitly taught in different subjects, like in religious study. The last much depends on the instructor's awareness that teaching ethical values incorporated in his own subject taught has a strategic position in future growth of culture and tourism. The development should be directed by values and lighted by knowledge to avoid tourism as a creator of havoc or turbulence for human and nature. The decline of Bali Tourism can be anticipated through systematic system of teaching of indigenous Balinese ethics. The fact shows busy life especially business which struggles for financial earnings does not pay much attention to the practice of ethics, rather they are only guided by formal rules and regulation issued by authority; they feel sufficient to follow the regulation issued by the authority concerned. Nonetheless, whatever forms of regulation has its core on ethical or moral values.

Ethics becomes integral part of Bali tourism establishment. Owing to this fact, at least there are five parties responsible for ethics of tourism education worth to mention in this regards, namely (1) government, (2) educational institution, (3) industries, (4) traditional local village (*desa pakraman*), and (5) mass media to preserve and spread ethical values and wisdom. When no significant effort attempted by the others, the authority should perform its job to make sure Bali tourism goes on right tract. The basic character of Bali tourism having its core of "culture tourism" becomes the basic spirit for all in developing tourism. Really speaking, in practice they are not only basically connected to each other in a system of a nation but each depends on the other in digitalized world. They are channels by which education of indigenous ethics may be spread and taught to peoples. It is expected they have a commitment to safe Bali from wrong tourism. Irrespective various channels may be utilized, the mater of ways to spread is worth to think of.

No tourism can develop well without the existence and role of government as the representation of all peoples. By status and position, it has authority, responsibility, and powers to be shared to others for reaching the formulated goal. Authority in the government of all levels or ranks of powers has a very strategic position to keep the running life of tourism in the right direction. Not only government connected bodies, but also private sectors who invested capitals also pay concerns on the sustainability of Bali tourism. Their cares are in the form of programs dedicated to society and environment as the manifestations of Corporate Social Responsibilities (CSR). However, the ways the powers are utilized is worth to consider. It is agreed that massive

development of tourism as desired by the government has certainly positive and negative impacts on the whole life of the people. A careful design of tourism can minimize its negative sides. For the last, a case often requires ethical justification as whether a particular action is categorized as ethical or unethical with reference to the values accepted by Balinese society. When justification uses western principles, often the case becomes unsolved even create worse thing in society; in this regards relativism of ethics is acknowledged.

Of the policy, from planning to evaluation step is an attempt to make sure that everything will run in the right direction. Not only keeping the rules and regulation run in a proper way, they should actively pronounce the importance of the local values for the sustenance of tourism using channels possible utilised. Since this authority is in contact with society as target of policies, they can find a way to tell the people the importance of ethical values and keeping the nature preserved well. The message should reach all especially the stake holders, industries, and education institutions. Tourism offices both of provincial and regency levels can have such program promoting ethical values to all. Or, creating a division in the government office to have a job making sure that these values are promoted and reached the targets. Calling for awareness is good, but it will be better if the office has a real program to educate the citizens and the tourism players. Bali since its economy largely depends on tourism, the promotion of ethical values is very important so that every people or parties with its power has a good understanding and awareness, and consequently, they can participate and do necessary action. For legislative board like house of parliament can get inspirations or insights from these values; and they are used as strength since every rules or regulation issued has its base on ethical values to keep the dignity, rights, and welfare of all.

Schools and universities are right places to spread these values through their systems of education. The case will become difficult since our school curriculum consists of a lot of subjects/papers to be learnt in a particular semester; whereas these values are not yet considered important to be taught to them. Presumably every Balinese knows the values, but the fact is not always true as people are getting more pragmatic only interested in short-term goal. If not in the form a separated subject, the values can be incorporated in related subjects like culture, religion, business or professional ethics, personality development, etc. as affective domain. In this regards, vocational studies especially the ones dealing with tourism has a pivotal role in educating the students the importance of indigenous ethical values. In so far, they learn ethical values based on western tradition. Suamba (2018) remarked that the establishment of Bali tourism as a business activity is not clear in terms of either using Western ethics, indigenous ethics or a mixture of both. Or people select one as a preference for business consideration only forgetting the continuation of culture. Nevertheless, it tends to adopt global trends in which Western way of life is predominant. The case has appeared when there was an intermingled of necessity between culture and tourism in which local ethics tends to be marginalized. Or when the guide line has taken local ethical sources, the implementation of it in business activities may be weak because too much emphasize on the security of culture, business sector may run slow³⁰. Local values can be incorporated in a subject in a curricula provided that there is a political will about that. Observing curricula of schools, indigenous ethics is not yet incorporated in national curriculum; however, these are

incorporated as a local material especially in elementary, secondary and high schools in culture, personality development and religion. Any principles which live in society will mean nothing unless it is communicated and taught to peoples. In addition to formal form of education, non-formal has an important role. However, in this form the spread is rather difficult since the focus on them perhaps not having direct connection with tourism. On formal education usually deals with practical skills in a short-term course dedicated for getting jobs only. In such form of education attention to ethical values paid is very less, except in a course which focuses on tourism, like guiding, hotel related skills, language course, practical mechanical/engineering course, etc.

Tourism as an industry grows fast in last 50 years which have changed the economy, social, culture, and mind set of Balinese, in addition to the massive conversation of land to become housing, shops, roads, tourism facilities, and infra structure. This is shown changes in their life style and the way they look at nature and human fellow. It is a frightening fact that imbalance of nature happens, as indicated by the cycles of rain is not systemic again like in the past, the intrusion of sea water has affected some areas in South Denpasar, global warming, sea abrasion, etc. Bali has changed drastically since then, and some Balinese are happy with these changes even though some of them would like to see again green beach, country side, farming land, birds, rivers like 50 years ago. Irrespective of different kinds of industry, this plays important role in keeping the ethical values like *tri-hita-karana* alive. The existence of *tri-hita-karana* awards by a foundation is good attempt to promote *tri-hita-karana* in hotel/restaurant of other tourism facilities. With these, owner or manager of a hotel will try to spread these values to staffs and workers to implement the values of *tri-hita-karana*.

When the establishment of industry building or compound/complex initially based on correct feasible study, the possibility to harm environment is likely small or even none, but in practice such rule breaking happens as noticed by media, environment or tourism activists. The way they spread the ethical values are communication to the owner, management personnel, and staff through face to face communication, social media, and website of the company. So many environment problems aroused stimulated by the establishment of an industrial facilities. The establishment of Bali Nirwana Resort some years ago very closed to Tanah Lot temple in Tabanan regency and the issue of Bena Gulf in Badung regency reclamation project, which can harm the ecology of South Bali region, are examples of environment problems that were initiated by industry. They would build hotel facilities without paying attention to its surrounding place especially intangible things. For big and huge company requires wide land, huge water, sufficient electric power, workers, etc. the feasible study should be careful done, otherwise disaster can be happened amidst the gain of financial benefit from the industry.

Traditional village (*desa pakraman*) is said to be the backbone of Balinese culture as in it the practices of religion and culture happens in a very established social system. Each member feels obliged to respect and to follow the norms or rules (called *awig-awig*). Formal system of the government also implements the development programs of society through this traditional village. One institution in it is youth group called *yowana* or *sekehe teruna-teruni*, who are usually under the period of schooling. Every times they have meeting or creating events like social works, sports,

health, economic activity, culture, and education. Under the guidance of the elders or village authority, they do activities for the betterment of being and the village. This activity can be viewed as a preparation to enter full-fledged member of traditional village (*desa adat*) after they get married. A close observation shows that ethical value is rather rare included in their program, much is on social functions. There is a kind of stigma in which youngsters are lack of ethics in their daily life; cannot perform proper action before the elders or society. Some of them are ignorant of ethical and cultural values which are professed by the society. Owing to this fact, ethical values can be taught through a more communicative way utilizing various approaches and methods suitable to their psychological developments. Art forms are effective tool to spread the ethical values since some kinds of entertainment indebted in it in addition to discussion with an ethical case as a lead. Story taken from classics or holy book and pronounced in communicative way will get high interests from them. Even movies or any material may be accessed from google may be of help in spreading the values worth applied in tourism.

For the last, i.e. media/mass media, its role is very strategic and has massive effects on society. It is acknowledged that media has a powerful force in civil society, and become one strong pillar in democracy. On line system or digital modes of communication including business is appealing so everyone takes part and finds its usefulness. When the youngsters are concerned, the spreading through media either printed or electronic is very useful; they are faster in spreading them. Rather than reading book or paper which is more times required, youngsters are fond of browsing and enjoying the menus presented in media. Nowadays, almost all youngsters living in cities even in villages used gadgets, so why don't make use of it in spreading ethical values? One may create website or blog even WA group to exchange information about ethical values useful in tourism through colourful pictures, diagram, short stories, animated story, fellow experiences, etc. Being a part of Balinese society and culture, they should have a sense of responsibility for the sustainability of tourism, nature, and culture, otherwise serious ecological problems will arise which can be devastated. The channels which may be utilized is through formal and informal education touching all elements of society. When formal education channel may be hard to use, informal or non-formal education channels still provides chance to educate society. Therefore, it requires political will and supports from all peoples to keep maintaining the tourism with its core in ethical values. As Suamba (2018) said that *tri-hita-karana* which is supposed to be the spirit of tourism and development program in Bali, it is basically a matter of ethical values that can be used to have a harmonious relationship with nature, human being, and divinity.

Even though by nature each human is good, however due to internal and external factors, one can be bad doing harms to others and environment. In such state it is required science of action or ethics to avoid vice action, on the other hand, one strives for virtues to maximize goodness in every human. Tourism as a business can spoil the purity of human being and nature due to uncontrolled desires in developing tourism. Ethical values originated from local culture has a strategic role in guiding peoples involved in tourism; we only develop right tourism rooted on science and moral values.

4 CONCLUSION

Tourism is a complex form of activities which involves people, business, leisure, nature and culture. The interactions of them may result in harms or benefits – to the host (and possibly the visitor too), to their communities, their economies, and their ecologies as many proofs have appeared. Business is inherently selfish – each seeking to maximize their personal (or group or corporate) value, and sometimes keeps blind to ecological matters. As tourism has been growing globally, awareness of its negative impact has caused a serious study or action taken on the foundation of tourism as a business activity and natural preservation. Ideally, both should go hand by hand without degrading human personality and preservation of culture and nature. Looking at these facts, awareness of the lack or absent of ethical values present in tourism practices is getting pertinent especially when there happens problem. As western values in ethics are widely adopted, people start looking at local or indigenous ethics. It is supposed to be contributed in such tourism establishments. With reference to Bali there are some principles of indigenous ethics, viz. divinity, *tri-hita-karana*, *tri-kala*, purity vs. impurity, parallelism of two different poles of reality, *tri mandala/tri-angga*, balancing, *atithi deva bhava*, and speak nice words to other. When classifying these ethical values that they can be grouped into three domains, viz. ethics for handling nature, human, and products or services including entertainment in tourism. These are supposed to be incorporated in tourism education for right tourism.

These ethical values comprise of Balinese hospitality in tourism, which can give visitor a different and unique experience while spending times in Bali. Owing to this fact, at least there are five parties worth to mention in this regards, namely (1) government, (2) educational institution, (3) industries, (4) traditional local village (*desa pakraman*), and (5) mass media to preserve, spread, and educate people ethical values and wisdom. In practice they are basically connected in a system of education. Irrespective various channels may be utilized, either formal or non-formal or informal, or mix of them, the matter of ways to spread profiting modern means is worth to think for successful ethical education in tourism.

REFERENCES

- Enea, C. (2007). The tourism industry of ethics and tourism. WSEAS Press. 166-170. <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/26991349.pdf>, retrieved 5th August 2019.
- Fennel, D. (2009). Ethics and tourism. *Philosophical issues in tourism*. (pp. 211-226). Bristol: Channel View Publication.
- Harrison, A. (2017). Ethical business practice, accountability, and quality assurance: primary drivers for sustainable in tourism development in Iceland. *Independent Study Project (ISP) Collection*. 2747. https://digitalcollections.sit.edu/isp_collection/2747.
- Hultsman, J. (1995). Just tourism: an ethical framework. *A.T.R.* 22 (3). 553-567.
- IDN Times Bali*. 19th October 2018. <https://bali.idntimes.com/news/bali/imamrosidin/kondisi-sawah-di-bali-tahun/full> retrieved on 5th July 2019].
- Kilipiris, F. and Zardava, S. (2012). Developing sustainable tourism in a changing environment: issues for the tourism enterprises (travel agencies and hospitality enterprises. *Procedia-*

- social and behavioral sciences*, 44. 44 - 52. www.sciencedirect.com, retrieved on 30th January 2019.
- Lovelock, B. and Lovelock, K. M. (2013). *The ethics of tourism: critical and applied perspectives*. London: Routledge.
- Mudana, I.G., Suamba, I.B.P., Putra, I.M.A, and Ardini, N.W. (2018). Practices of Bali tourism development, three folding, and *tri hita karana* local knowledge in new order Indonesia. *J. Phys.: Conf. Ser.* 953 012108. 1-13. <https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/953/1/012108>.
- Mungra, P. (2007). Book Review, Issue 1. *The Journal of English as an International Language*, Vol. 1, pp. 102-104, <https://www.eilj.com/>, retrieved 18th July 2020.
- Stewart, G.A. (1998). Hotels, Tours, and Tables: A Comprehensive Elective CALL Course for Tourism/Hospitality Majors in Asia. *The Asian ESP Journal*, Dec. 1998, Vol. 4, Issue 7.1 (pp.193-243), <https://www.asian-esp-journal.com/>, retrieved 18th July 2020.
- Suamba, I.B.P. and Utama, I. K. (2017). Materiality and spirituality in Bali tourism: an ethical reflection on the *Tri-hita-karana*. *IJASTE*, 1(1), 82-93. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.31940/ijaste.v1i1>.
- Suamba, I.B.P. (2018). Indigenous ethics in Balinese cultural tourism. *ICAST* <https://www.edas.info/showPaper.php?m=1570493833>, 24/8/2019.
- Suamba, I.B.P. (2019). Buddhist ethics in the establishments of green tourism in Tu and Thien (Eds.) *Buddhist Approach to Responsible Consumption and Sustainable Development* (pp. 52-53). Hanoi: Hong Duc Publishing House.
- Tribe, J. (ed.). (2009). *Philosophical issues in tourism*. Bristol: Channel View Publication
- Wight, P. (1993). Ecotourism: ethics or eco-shell? *J.T.R.*, Winter. jtr.sagepub.com.
- Wikipedia contributor. "Hospitality" in *Wikipedia, Free Encyclopaedia*. <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Hospitality>, retrieved on 18th August 2017.

Indigenous Ethics in Tourism Education: Bali as a Case

ORIGINALITY REPORT

17%

SIMILARITY INDEX

13%

INTERNET SOURCES

11%

PUBLICATIONS

11%

STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	documents.mx Internet Source	2%
2	Submitted to University of Edinburgh Student Paper	2%
3	ojs.pnb.ac.id Internet Source	2%
4	es.slideshare.net Internet Source	1%
5	Hultsman, J.. "Just tourism", <i>Annals of Tourism Research</i> , 1995 Publication	1%
6	I G Mudana, I B P Suamba, I M A Putra, N W Ardini. " Practices of Bali Tourism Development, Threefolding, and Local Knowledge in New Order Indonesia ", <i>Journal of Physics: Conference Series</i> , 2018 Publication	1%
7	www.answers.com Internet Source	1%

8	Submitted to Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia Student Paper	1 %
9	campusabroad.co.in Internet Source	1 %
10	John Hultsman. "Just tourism", Annals of Tourism Research, 1995 Publication	1 %
11	www.researchgate.net Internet Source	1 %
12	en.wikipedia.org Internet Source	1 %
13	Submitted to University of Queensland Student Paper	1 %
14	www.ukessays.com Internet Source	<1 %
15	www.eurojournals.com Internet Source	<1 %
16	www.tandfonline.com Internet Source	<1 %
17	Submitted to University of Wales Institute, Cardiff Student Paper	<1 %
18	Submitted to National Economics University Student Paper	<1 %

19	Submitted to Murdoch University Student Paper	<1 %
20	nou.edu.ng Internet Source	<1 %
21	Submitted to Southampton Solent University Student Paper	<1 %
22	A A A Wulandari, S B Yogita, P M Simanjuntak. "The Application of Balinese Tri Hita Karana and Tri Loka Concept in Children's Creativity Hub in Kuta, Bali", IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science, 2021 Publication	<1 %
23	saytc.co.za Internet Source	<1 %
24	David A. Fennell. "Exploring the boundaries of a new moral order for tourism's global code of ethics: an opinion piece on the position of animals in the tourism industry", Journal of Sustainable Tourism, 2014 Publication	<1 %
25	cf.cdn.unwto.org Internet Source	<1 %
26	internationalinventjournals.org Internet Source	<1 %
27	www.science.gov Internet Source	<1 %

Exclude quotes On

Exclude matches Off

Exclude bibliography On